



Rincon Consultants, Inc.

Environmental Scientists

Planners

Engineers

MEMORANDUM

- | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|---|
| <p>■ Ventura
180 North Ashwood Avenue
Ventura, California
93003
805 644 4455</p> | <p>□ San Luis Obispo
1530 Monterey Street
Suite D
San Luis Obispo, California
93401
805 547 0900</p> | <p>□ Carlsbad
2215 Faraday Avenue
Suite A
Carlsbad, California
92008
760 918 9444</p> | <p>□ Monterey
437 Figueroa Street
Suite 203
Monterey, California
93940
831 333 0310</p> | <p>□ Oakland
449 15th Street
Suite 303
Oakland, California
94612
510 834 4455</p> |
| <p>□ Fresno
7080 North Whitney Avenue, Suite 101
Fresno, California
93720
559 228 9925</p> | <p>□ Sacramento
4825 J Street
Suite 200
Sacramento, California
95819
916 706 1374</p> | <p>□ Los Angeles
250 East 1st Street
Suite 301
Los Angeles, California
90012
213 788 4842</p> | <p>□ Santa Barbara
209 E. Victoria Avenue
Santa Barbara, California
93101
805 644 4455</p> | <p>□ Redlands
301 9th Street
Suite 109
Redlands, California
92374
909 253 0705</p> |

Date: October 31, 2019

To: Glenn Michitsch, Senior Planner

Organization: City of Calabasas

From: Ryan Gilmore, Certified Arborist/Biologist

Email: rgilmore@rinconconsultants.com

cc: Isarquilla@rinconconsultants.com; jpower@rinconconsultants.com

Re: Peer Review of Post-Woolsey Fire Oak Assessment for the West Village Development Project Report (prepared by Carlberg Associates)

International Society of Arboriculture (ISA) Certified Arborist, Ryan Gilmore, of Rincon Consultants, Inc. conducted a peer review of the Post-Woolsey Fire Oak Assessment for the West Village Development Project Report prepared by Carlberg Associates (dated July 31, 2019; "Oak Assessment report") to determine completeness and accuracy of the Oak Assessment report.

The Oak Assessment report assessed all of the property oak trees that were burned in the Woolsey Fire in November of 2018. The subject 206 oak trees were originally inventoried and submitted under the project's Oak Tree Report dated June 15, 2017. Rincon reviewed the original oak tree report and submitted a peer review memorandum dated July 10, 2017. The original oak tree report addressed all of the minimum requirements for the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Reports as listed in the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines, dated April 1993.

The Oak Assessment report specifically assessed the extent of burn severity for all of the 206 oak trees, which includes the following information:

- Location of tree
- Tree tag number
- Species
- Pre-fire diameter at 4 1/2 feet above natural grade
- Fire Severity Rating
- Canopy cover information pre-fire
- Physical structure post-fire
- Horticultural evaluation
- Health rating

The Oak Assessment report states that all 206 oak trees burned, with a severity rating as follows:

- Eight (8) oak trees have minor fire damage
- 21 oak trees have moderate fire damage
- 177 oak trees have severe fire damage

On October 14, 2019 Rincon's ISA Certified Arborist conducted a site visit for the entire project site to observe the burned trees and confirm the accuracy of the Oak Assessment report.

The arborist noted the following discrepancy:

- Tree Numbers 195 through 198 have been removed since the submission of the Oak Assessment report. The four removed oak trees consisted of three coast live oaks (*Quercus agrifolia*) and a single valley oak (*Quercus lobata*). These four oak trees were rated as severely burned with only stumps or leafless branches (dead crown) remaining. These removed oak trees were located in a maintained ornamental landscape on the Shea Homes Property (offsite). Additionally, it was observed that three new coast live oak trees have been planted near the removed trees. These removals are likely exempt from the City's permitting requirements as described in Chapter 17.32.010.B.2 of the Oak Tree Regulations Ordinance (Ordinance). This section of the Ordinance exempts tree removals due to wildfire damage. In this case the four subject oak trees were severely damaged, three of which had only burned stumps remaining.

It is Rincon's professional opinion that the Post-Woolsey Fire Oak Assessment for the West Village Development Project Report is accurate with the above noted exception, based on the information made available, and on the field review of the site conditions.